PAPER #1: Review Criteria

This activity serves as a guideline for both our peer review and self-review. Please use both the questions and peer feedback as guides for how to revise the final draft. Peer reviewers should read the paper, marking both effective moments of writing and marking potential concerns in the margins and directly into text.

Use an X to mark if this is a peer review  or a self-review .

If peer review, please add the name of the reviewer:

1. Title (see the [Dealing with Titles](http://halhalbert.com/common/titles_MLA_style.html#:~:text=Your%20Own%20Title,the%20font%20size.) handout)

* Is the title specific to the author’s unique topic? In other words, does it avoid a generic label like “Puritans,” “Paper 1,” etc.? Does it allude to the specific topic to inform readers about the specific focus of the paper? How might the wording of the title be improved?
* Is the title centered using the center command instead of tabs or the space bar? Yes  No
* Did the author refrain from increasing the font size or using italics, bold or underline to mark your own title? Yes  No  What do they need to remove?

1. Introduction

* Does the first sentence hook the reader and identify the specific issue beyond a straightforward fact about a text or author? In other words, will a reader understand from the first sentence what the specific concern about the novel is the primary focus of the paper?
* Does the introduction set up the core problem briefly but clearly? If so, restate it here. If not, suggest a thesis statement here.
* Does the introduction avoid going into heavily detailed discussion of a specific individual point that would be better saved for a body paragraph?

Yes  No   
  
If “no,” what part should be trimmed or cut?

* Does the author list the major points they plan to make in the introduction?  
    
  Yes  No
* Do the author have a clear thesis statement that offers a specific interpretation (rather than statement of the topic that doesn’t take a particular stance on the topic) that defines what they are arguing for at the end of the paragraph? If so, restate it here. If not, suggest one here:
* Does the introduction clearly identify the key texts and authors being used in the introduction? Are [the titles marked correctly according to MLA format?](http://halhalbert.com/common/titles_MLA_style.html)

1. Body paragraphs

* Does the paragraph start with the required tab/indention of 0.5”?  
    
   Yes  No
* Does each body paragraph start with a clear transition that provides a connection to the previous paragraph?  
    
  Yes  No   
    
  If no, be sure to mark on the draft where a transition is needed. If you can, suggest some transitional ideas on the draft.
* Does the first sentence set up a clear topic for the paragraph?  
    
  Yes  No   
    
  If no, be sure to mark on the draft where a paragraph topic is needed. Suggest a topic if possible that encapsulates the contents of the paragraph.
* Does each major point and supporting evidence relate to that topic sentence, or should some be removed?  
    
  Yes  No   
    
  If no, be sure to mark on the draft where supporting evidence is needed or should be removed.
* If the paragraph is too short (less than four lines), what facts or further explanations can be added to properly develop the topic of the paragraph? Please mark this on the draft.
* Do the body paragraphs have at least one quotation to support the claim in the topic sentence? Please indicate on the draft where a quotation is needed.
* If the paragraph goes on for a page or more (which may be acceptable), where could it be divided into subparagraphs? Please mark on the draft.
* Does the paragraph end with a clear point that does NOT introduce a new idea that will only be discussed in the next paragraph? If the author does introduce a new idea that is actually the topic of the next paragraph, suggest moving that line to the next paragraph.
* Is there a clear connection to the author’s overall thesis for the paper? Please indicate when a paragraph does not connect to the overall thesis on the draft.

1. Use of [Quotations](http://halhalbert.com/common/quotes_citations/quotes.htm) and [Citations](https://owl.purdue.edu/owl/research_and_citation/mla_style/mla_formatting_and_style_guide/mla_in_text_citations_the_basics.html)

* REGULAR QUOTES: Does each quotation have a [signal phrase](http://halhalbert.com/common/quotes_citations/quotes.htm#signal), the actual words you are quoting inside quotation marks, an [MLA parenthetical citation](https://owl.purdue.edu/owl/research_and_citation/mla_style/mla_formatting_and_style_guide/mla_in_text_citations_the_basics.html) at the end of the sentence that allows the reader to find the source in the alphabetical works cited, and discussion? Did the author drop the final punctuation of the quotation (unless it’s a question or exclamation mark)? Is the citation before the final period of the sentence?
* BLOCK QUOTE: Do the paper have at least one [block quote](https://owl.purdue.edu/owl/research_and_citation/mla_style/mla_formatting_and_style_guide/mla_formatting_quotations.html#:~:text=LONG%20QUOTATIONS,original%20as%20possible.)? [Is it indented 0.5” from the left?](http://www.halhalbert.com/common/word2007.html#:~:text=TO%20INDENT%20A,indent%20to%200.5%22.) Is it four lines (in the 1” margins) or longer? Did the author avoid indenting the first line of their text after the block quote in which they discuss the block quote’s meaning? Did they omit quotation marks for their block quote? Does the block quote citation come after the final punctuation of the quotation?
* Are additional facts/ideas/statistics not in the novel given a citation even if they are not quotations? Is there a source in the Works Cited for those citations?
* Do the author avoid putting a quotation in the first or last sentence of a paragraph?

1. Conclusion

* Did the author avoid starting their conclusion with “In conclusion”?
* Does the conclusion restate the topic, all the major points in the paper, and the main thesis that offers a specific interpretation of the novel?
* Does the conclusion attempt to explain the broader implications of the thesis?

1. Works Cited Page

* Does the MLA works cited page start at the top of its own page using the insert🡪page break command in MS Word?
* Do the words “Works Cited” (without the quotation marks) appear at the top of the page centered using the center command?
* Is there an entry foreach key text mentioned in the introduction?
* Do entries from the class textbook anthology follow the “[Work in an Anthology](https://owl.purdue.edu/owl/research_and_citation/mla_style/mla_formatting_and_style_guide/mla_works_cited_page_books.html#:~:text=Hopkins%20UP%2C%201997.-,A%20WORK%20IN%20AN%20ANTHOLOGY%2C%20REFERENCE%2C%20OR%20COLLECTION,%2C%20edited%20by%20Steven%20Heller%2C%20Allworth%20Press%2C%201998%2C%20pp.%2013%2D24.,-Note%20on%20Cross)” model?
* If multiple texts from the class textbook anthology are used, are [the rules for works cited cross-referencing used](https://owl.purdue.edu/owl/research_and_citation/mla_style/mla_formatting_and_style_guide/mla_works_cited_page_books.html#:~:text=Note%20on%20Cross,the%20entire%20list.)?
* Is each entry presented alphabetically (do not alphabetize by the words “A,” “An,” or “The”)?
* Are the [titles](http://halhalbert.com/common/titles_MLA_style.html) of shorter items (articles, individual pages on a web site, etc.) put inside quotation marks?
* Are the [titles](http://halhalbert.com/common/titles_MLA_style.html) of larger items (books, newspapers, databases, web sites, journals, etc.) italicized?
* Did the author [standardize all capitalization following MLA title rules](http://halhalbert.com/common/titles_MLA_style.html#:~:text=Capitalization%3A,article%20or%20preposition.)?
* Did the use the [hanging indent command](file:////Users/hhalbert/Documents/Documents/--MontCo/~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~Fall%202024/ENG%20101/TO%20CREATE%20A%20HANGING%20INDENT%20FOR%20A%20WORKS%20CITED%20ENTRY%20%20Highlight%20works%20cited%20entry%20RIGHT%20CLICK%20selected%20text%20and%20choose%20PARAGRAPH%20Change%20the%20indentation%20special%20option%20to%20HANGING%20INDENT.) to format each citation so that the first line touches the left margin, but the rest of the lines in the citation are indented 0.5”?
* Did the author [turn off the gap between paragraphs](file:////Users/hhalbert/Documents/Documents/Web%20Pages/Dreamweaver/HalhalbertDOTcom/classes/spring2025/eng102/assignments/TO%20REMOVE%20GAP%20BETWEEN%20PARAGRAPHS%20%20Highlight%20entire%20paper%20RIGHT%20CLICK%20selected%20text%20and%20choose%20PARAGRAPH.%20Click%20the%20box%20next%20to%20%22Don't%20add%20space%20between%20paragraphs%20of%20the%20same%20style%22%20so%20that%20a%20checkmark%20appears.) on the works cited page?
* Is each citation double spaced?
* Does the works cited page look like the [sample MLA Works Cited Page](https://owl.purdue.edu/owl/research_and_citation/mla_style/mla_formatting_and_style_guide/mla_sample_works_cited_page.html)?

1. Format

* Does the paper’s layout match the [sample MLA paper](https://owl.purdue.edu/owl/research_and_citation/mla_style/mla_formatting_and_style_guide/mla_sample_paper.html)?
* Is the paper double spaced?
* Are the margins 1” on each side?
* Did the author [turn off the gap between paragraphs](http://www.halhalbert.com/common/word2007.html#:~:text=TO%20REMOVE%20GAP,a%20checkmark%20appears.) throughout?
* In the header of the paper, does the author’s last name appear in the upper right corner followed by a single space and the page number ([using the insert🡪 page number command](http://www.halhalbert.com/common/word2007.html#:~:text=TO%20INSERT%20AND,AND%20FOOTER%20button.))?
* Did the author use Times New Roman 12 pt font? Even in the header?
* Does the information block contain the right information required by [MLA format? Is the date correct?](https://owl.purdue.edu/owl/research_and_citation/mla_style/mla_formatting_and_style_guide/mla_general_format.html#:~:text=Formatting%20the%20First,in%20MLA%20style%3A) Did the author replace “Professor” with “Dr.”? Did they put a space between “Dr.” and the professor’s name?

1. Word Choice/Editing

* Did the author avoid “I” statements that are not about direct experiences being used as evidence (like “I think/believe/feel”)? (Use control-F to check for “I” followed by a space)
* Did they avoid “You” statements? (Use control-F to check for “you”)
* Did they use more specific language to replace variations on the word “thing”? (Use control-F to search for “thing”)
* Did they verify that the reader can easily understand what “it” refers to in the paper? (Use control-F to search for “it”)
* Did the author put a noun or noun phrase after the word “this”? (Use control-F to search for “this”).
* For the AUTHOR ONLY: Did you read your paper out loud to listen for problematic or incomplete sentences?